



Republic of the Philippines  
Supreme Court  
Manila

February 5, 2007

**Atty. DEMOSTHENES B. DONATO**

Donato Zarate & Rodriguez Law Office  
7<sup>th</sup> Floor, Electra House  
115 Esteban Street, Legaspi Village  
1229 Makati City

Dear Atty. Donato,

This is in response to your letter dated January 23, 2007 filed in G.R. Nos. 174153 and 174299.

In the subject letter, you requested for a certified copy of the Summary of the Voting on the Resolution dated January 16, 2007, whereby petitioner Lambino's Motion for Leave to File a Second Motion for Reconsideration was denied on the ground that there was no sufficient vote to grant the same.

Please be advised that, with the exception of retired Chief Justice Artemio V. Panganiban, the Members of the Court maintained their votes in the main decision in resolving the instant Motion for Leave to File a Second Motion for Reconsideration.

A perusal of the main decision will clearly reveal that only seven (7) Justices voted for the granting of the petition –Justices Puno (now Chief Justice), Quisumbing, Corona, Tinga, Chico-Nazario, Garcia and Velasco, Jr. Their votes were not sufficient to overturn the majority opinion penned by Justice Carpio and concurred in by then Chief Justice Panganiban and Justices Ynares-Santiago, Sandoval-Gutierrez, Austria-Martinez, Carpio-Morales, Callejo, Sr., and Azcuna.

Very truly yours,

*MA. LUISA D. VILLARAMA*  
**MA. LUISA D. VILLARAMA**  
Clerk of Court